



DIJEMSS:
Dinasti International Journal of Education
Management and Social Science

E-ISSN: 2686-6331
P-ISSN: 2686-6358

<https://dinastipub.org/DIJEMSS> ✉ dinasti.info@gmail.com ☎ +62 811 7404 455

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.38035/dijemss.v6i3>
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Collaborative Governance Process in Supporting Public Private Partnership in Singkawang Airport Development in 2023-2024

Maya Novita Sari¹, Nandang Alamsah Deliarnoor², Novie Indrawati Sagita³

¹Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Padjadjaran, maya23010@mail.unpad.ac.id

²Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Padjadjaran, nandang.alamsyah@unpad.ac.id

³Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Padjadjaran, novie.indrawati.sagita@unpad.ac.id

Corresponding Author: maya23010@mail.unpad.ac.id

Abstract: This research is driven by the inadequacies in the collaborative process within the Public-Private Partnership (PPP) scheme, which has hindered the operationalization of Singkawang Airport, despite its inauguration by the President of Indonesia on March 20, 2024. The collaboration involves key actors, including the Central Government through the Ministry of Transportation, the Singkawang City Government, PT Penjaminan Infrastruktur Indonesia, CSR Team and the local community surrounding the airport construction site. Adopting the cross-sector collaboration framework proposed by Bryson, Crosby, and Stone, this study aims to analyze and elucidate the Collaborative Governance process in the development of Singkawang Airport by examining six dimensions: forging initial agreements, building leadership, building legitimacy, building trust, managing conflict, and planning. This study employs a qualitative research method, with data collected through interviews, observations, and document analysis. Informants were selected using purposive and snowball sampling techniques. The findings reveal that the Collaborative Governance process in the PPP scheme for Singkawang Airport is partially evident across the six dimensions. The first dimension, forging initial agreements, highlights the absence of formal agreements underpinning the collaboration. The second dimension, building leadership, demonstrates the presence of both formal and informal leadership structures. In the third dimension, building legitimacy, both internal and external legitimacy have been established. The fourth dimension, building trust, reveals that trust-building efforts are limited to periodic meetings conducted several months apart. The fifth dimension, managing conflict, shows a lack of preventive measures necessary to sustain trust. Finally, the sixth dimension, planning, indicates that while initial plans were formulated, they required dynamic adjustments to address emergent challenges during implementation. In conclusion, this study underscores that relying solely on the PPP scheme poses significant challenges to the realization of the airport project. Cross-sector collaboration has accelerated the development process but remains suboptimal, as it does not fully address the six dimensions of effective collaboration.

Keyword: collaborative governance, public-private partnership, airport development

INTRODUCTION

Singkawang City is a city with good economic development (Muazir & Hsieh, 2019). Singkawang is known as the second largest trade and service city in West Kalimantan after Pontianak City as the provincial capital (Chiang & Cheng, 2019). This good economic development is supported by tourism potential that is not owned by other regencies or cities in West Kalimantan. This is also supported by the branding of Singkawang City as the Most Tolerant City in Indonesia which has been obtained 4 times in a row every year (Setyowati, Astuti, & Kurniawan, 2020; Maisondra, 2023; Submitter, Elyta, & Herlan, 2021). This makes the charm of Singkawang City even more attractive to people outside Singkawang City. This is evidenced by the significant increase in tourist visits. Although in 2020 to 2021 tourist visits to Singkawang City decreased due to the Covid-19 pandemic, Singkawang City was able to recover in 2022 with the highest number of tourists in the last five years. The visitor trend in Singkawang City continues to increase due to several national and international tourism events that are regularly held (Mandasari & Setiawan, 2023; Nyoto et al., 2023).

Based on this, the government considers that Singkawang City already needs transportation access in the form of an airport. The existence of an airport will certainly expand the reach of Singkawang City for visitors, both from within and outside the country (Ong, Ormond, & Sulianti, 2017; Hertzman, 2020). This certainly makes a significant contribution to increasing the number of tourist visits, which in turn will encourage local economic growth through tourist spending. The presence of an airport will also open up new business opportunities and trigger growth in the entire tourism sector (Khan et al., 2020). With the presence of airport infrastructure, there will be an increase in demand for supporting services such as transportation, accommodation, and other tourism facilities that will create new jobs and increase investment in the area (Dimitriou & Sartzetaki, 2022; Mandić, Mrnjavac, & Kordić, 2018). Overall, the construction of an airport in Singkawang is a very important step in accelerating the growth of tourism and the regional economy through the multiplier effect it creates. This will create a broad positive impact, not only in terms of economic growth, but also in preserving culture and improving the welfare of the local community.

Singkawang Airport has been under construction since 2019 until 2023, with a public private partnership (PPP) financing scheme (Hadi, Hamzah, & Sofilda, 2023; Isdairi & Sihalo, 2021). The total budget for the construction of this airport is IDR 427 billion, with details of the state budget of IDR 272 billion and Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) from Singkawang entrepreneurs of IDR 155 billion. Singkawang Airport was inaugurated on March 20, 2024. However, it turned out that after the inauguration, Singkawang Airport was still unable to operate.

The reason why Singkawang Airport has not yet been operational is not only because the construction of access roads to the airport has not been completed. However, it turns out that there is another more crucial problem, namely that the PPP scheme process for Singkawang Airport has not been fully completed. The construction of Singkawang Airport has been carried out since the beginning of planning using the PPP scheme (Hadi, Hamzah, & Sofilda, 2023). In the PPP scheme, the construction stage has been completed, but the auction stage for the party that will manage Singkawang Airport has not been completed (Putro & Nugraha, 2023). Apart from that, there is a problem in the form of low interest from airlines to fill flight routes at Singkawang Airport (Nugraha, 2024).

This problem is what attracts attention to be studied, because researchers suspect that the PPP scheme alone is not enough to make the construction of Singkawang Airport a success, but there must be an ideal collaboration process so that the inaugurated airport can operate. This is supported by the opinion of experts who stated that PPP is only an initial process so that PPP requires a collaboration process in order to function (Ansell & Gash,

2008; Nusriadi et al., 2023; Velotti, Botti, & Vesci, 2012; Xiong et al., 2019). In the collaboration process, it certainly involves actors of cross-sector collaboration (Bryson, Crosby, & Stone, 2015; Kitsie, Ansari, & Volberda, 2018; Cairns & Harris, 2011; Van Tulder et al., 2016). Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006) argue that organizations must work together across sectors, including government, business, non-profit organizations, communities, and the general public. Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006) emphasize several aspects in the collaboration process and focus on six aspects, namely forging initial agreements, building leadership, building legitimacy, building trust, managing conflict, and planning.

Initial identification shows, first, in the aspect of the ideal forging initial agreements, of course, there must be an agreement from all collaboration actors. The agreement on the PPP collaboration for the construction of Singkawang Airport is only an informal agreement. The agreement is not stated in a formal agreement such as a Cooperation Agreement between agencies or a Decree on the formation of a Cross-Sectoral Team containing all collaboration actors. Second, in the aspect of building leadership, there is something interesting, namely that in addition to the presence of the role of formal leaders, namely leaders from the Ministry of Transportation and the Singkawang City Government, an informal leader figure has emerged whose role is quite strong, namely Mrs. Tjhai Chui Mie, SH, MH, through her hands, the construction of Singkawang Airport has succeeded in getting CSR contributions from successful entrepreneurs from Singkawang City. Third, in the aspect of building legitimacy or building ideal legitimacy, the PPP collaboration process for the development of Singkawang Airport has formed legitimacy for this collaboration, even this collaboration has been recognized and its performance has been appreciated by the President. Fourth, in the aspect of building trust, collaboration actors should routinely hold evaluation meetings for the PPP scheme for the development of Singkawang Airport to establish and foster trust from each collaboration actor, but in several meetings not all were able to attend the evaluation meeting. Fifth, in the aspect of managing conflict, it is apparent that there have been no preventive efforts to manage conflicts that will occur so that existing conflicts will be difficult to resolve. This will hinder the progress of the PPP scheme for Singkawang Airport. Sixth, related to planning, initially the collaboration actors set a timeline or deadline for the progress of the PPP scheme for Singkawang Airport, but until now the timeline or deadline has not been met by all collaboration actors so that the PPP process from Singkawang Airport has been hampered.

Based on the explanation above, this study aims to analyze the collaborative governance process of Singkawang Airport development when viewed from the application of aspects of forging initial agreements, building leadership, building legitimacy, building trust, managing conflict, and planning.

METHOD

This study applies a qualitative approach. Data was collected from interviews, observations, and document studies. Interviews were conducted on informants who were part of every collaboration actor. Collaboration actor from this study consisted of various sectors of the central government represented by the Ministry of Transportation who became the leading sector that handled transportation affairs, the Singkawang City Government which became the government where the location of the airport construction, PT Penjaminan Infrastruktur Indonesia (PT PII) as a business entity that facilitated the PPP process For Singkawang Airport, the CSR team at the construction of Singkawang Airport and also the community lives around Singkawang Airport. Then, passive observations are carried out

By only listening in meeting activities or open meetings related to the construction of Singkawang Airport. The documents collected in the form of (a) Government Policy Documents (such as planning documents related to airport construction, central and regional

government regulations, cooperation agreements, PPP documents for Singkawang Airport), (b) media documents (in the form of news in the mass media or social regarding the construction of Singkawang Airport), and (c) Non-Government Organizational Documents (documents or reports from the entrepreneur from Singkawang who are the CSR Team for the construction of Singkawang Airport). After the data is collected, researchers conduct data analysis with the Miles & Huberman model which states that data analysis consists of three activity flow, namely data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Researchers analyzed this problem with the view of cross-sector collaboration processes by Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006) which states that aspects of forging initial agreements, building leadership, building legitimacy, building trust, managing converts, and planning are the key to the success of the process of cross-sectoral collaboration. The views of Bryson, Crosby, and Stone on cross-sector collaboration theory are very in accordance with the empirical issues in this study because the collaboration in this study was conducted by cross -sector, namely the government, business entities, CSR teams and the community. In addition, these aspects can describe the common thread of the problem in the PPP scheme from the development of Singkawang Airport.

Forging Initial Agreements

In the context of the construction of Singkawang Airport, the absence of a formal agreement between the actors involved creates a significant gap in the collaboration process. The absence of an official agreement document governing the rights and obligations of each party has the potential to interfere with the effectiveness and efficiency of the project.

Related to this aspect, in the process of collaborative governance in the construction of Singkawang Airport, there are still limitations in terms of formal agreements involving all major parties, especially between the Singkawang City Government and the Ministry of Transportation. Until now, the Ministry of Transportation as the person in charge of implementing the activity has not made a formal cooperation agreement or memorandum of understanding that involves those who play a role in the PPP scheme.

This condition shows that the cooperative relationship that exists between the Singkawang City Government and the Ministry of Transportation, as well as the private parties involved in the airport construction project, is still at a non-formal level. Although there are forms of communication and coordination that occur periodically, there are no formal legal documents that can be used as a legal basis to strengthen the commitment of collaboration between all parties. This has implications for the absence of legal certainty in terms of the division of tasks, responsibilities, and authority of decision making that is legally binding among the actors involved.

However, in the midst of limited formal agreement, the Singkawang City Government still shows its commitment to fully support the construction of Singkawang Airport through the issuance of legal products at the local level. One concrete form of this commitment is the existence of two Decree of the Mayor of Singkawang, namely Decree Number 553.2/461/Dishub.PPT-A in 2021 concerning the Establishment of the Airport Development Planning Team for the Government Cooperation Scheme with Business Entities, and Decree Number 553.2/462/Dishub.PPT-A in 2021 concerning the Establishment of a Cross-Sectoral Team for the Acceleration of the Construction of the Singkawang Airport in West Kalimantan Province.

Both of these decree clearly illustrate the efforts of the Singkawang City Government to develop a work structure that can support the planning and acceleration of airport development at the local level. Although only limited to regional apparatus and vertical

agencies in the Singkawang City area, this legal product is a strong proof that the city government has the seriousness in seeking the success of this development project. The cross-sectoral team formed through both decree played a role in coordinating local needs related to the provision of basic infrastructure such as electricity, telecommunications, and land acquisition, which is an important aspect in airport development.

In addition, this legal product shows the initiative of the Singkawang City Government to take proactive steps in preparing various technical and administrative aspects under its authority. Although they do not have the authority in preparing a formal agreement with the Ministry of Transportation or the private sector involved in the PPP scheme, this step is an indication that the Singkawang City Government wants to ensure their role is recognized in this development process. Thus, the legal products issued not only function as administrative instruments, but also as political statements and support for national strategic projects.

In the context of Collaborative Governance, the steps taken by the Singkawang City Government can be understood as a form of local strategy to strengthen their position in collaboration, although there is no formal agreement involving all main actors. The Singkawang City Government seems to understand that their involvement in this project is important to ensure the interests of the region remain accommodated in the development process involving national and private actors. Therefore, the issuance of local legal products is a tool used to confirm their role and demonstrate commitment to the smooth running and success of the project.

However, this limitation also shows the importance of the formation of formal agreements between the Singkawang City Government, the Ministry of Transportation, and private parties. Without a binding formal legal foundation, this collaboration still has the potential to face challenges in terms of broader coordination, especially related to the division of responsibilities and decision making at a higher level. To ensure the success of this project in the long run, it is important for all actors to immediately form a formal agreement that not only binds legally, but also strengthens the trust and commitment among all actors.

Thus, even though the formal agreement does not yet exist, legal products issued by the Singkawang City Government can be seen as a proactive step to support the construction of Singkawang Airport. However, the success of this collaboration will still be very dependent on the creation of a formal agreement between all the actors involved, especially in the PPP scheme. The Singkawang City Government has shown its seriousness through local initiatives, and furthermore, stronger collaboration is needed at the national level to ensure that this project can run well and in accordance with expectations.

Building Leadership

In every cross-sector collaboration process, leadership plays a central role in directing actors to achieve common goals. This is what Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006) said that building leadership not only talks about formal leadership carried by government officials or figures who have official authority, but also non-formal leadership that emerged from individuals or groups who have a big influence without must have a formal position.

There is a formal leadership led by the Ministry of Transportation, through the Directorate General of Civil Aviation, namely the person in charge of the cooperation project that plays a central role in the implementation of the construction of Singkawang Airport. The Ministry of Transportation, especially the Directorate General of Civil Aviation, is responsible for the supervision and management of the entire development process, including coordination with various related parties. The role of this formal leadership ensures that all steps in the project, starting from the planning stage to preparation, running in accordance with applicable and directed regulations in accordance with the purpose of developing transportation infrastructure in the region. The Directorate General of Civil Aviation also

holds authority in important decision making, including the selection of investment return schemes and operational policy determination.

In addition, there is the presence of non-formal leadership in the collaboration of the construction of Singkawang Airport can be identified through the emergence of "champions" or figures who are persistent in fighting for the realization of this project. These figures are not just formal leaders, but rather non-formal figures who have a strong vision, enthusiasm, and will to fight the various challenges that arise during the development process. The figure who acts as a "champions" is the one who is able to move and unite various stakeholders, both from the government, the private sector, and the community to collaborate in order to achieve common goals. Their courage in taking initiatives, as well as tenacity in dealing with obstacles, is a key in maintaining the momentum of the project and ensuring the smooth process of collaboration.

The non-formal leadership is played by Mrs. Tjhai Chui Mie (former Mayor) and Mr. Pui Sudarto (founder of PT Intan) in accordance with the building leadership aspects because they act as champions who are actively building relationships, mobilizing resources, and motivating other stakeholders. Mrs. Tjhai and Mr. Pui Sudarto not only support financially and strategically, but also strengthen the trust and relations between local governments, central and private parties. Their courage in taking initiatives and building synergy shows that non-formal leadership can create significant influences in achieving collaboration goals.

Building Legitimacy

In the aspect of building legitimacy it is understood that cross -sectoral collaboration is more likely to be successful when every party involved is aware of and recognizes the existence of collaboration that is built. In addition, recognition from external parties, such as other agencies or the community, is also important to strengthen the legitimacy of the collaboration. If each party is actively involved and mutual trust, then the cooperation will be easier to run smoothly and continuously.

The first legitimacy in the Singkawang Airport construction project came from the person in charge of the project cooperation project, namely the Minister of Transportation who directly recognized and even appreciated the success of cross -sector collaboration involved in this project. The second legitimacy was conveyed by the Singkawang City Government which in this case was conveyed by the person in charge of the Mayor of Singkawang. Furthermore, this collaboration was also legitimized by PT. Penjaminan Infrastruktur Indonesia (PII). Another collaboration actor is the CSR Team Leader from the construction of Singkawang City Airport who also acknowledged the existence of cross -sector collaboration in the Singkawang Airport PPP process.

Cross-sectoral collaboration according to Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006) stated that cross -sector collaboration legitimacy was not only found from the internal collaboration actors, but there was also a recognition or legitimacy of external or actors outside of the collaboration actors. In cross -sectoral collaboration, this collaboration legitimacy was also found from various parties. One of the parties who clearly stated the recognition of this collaboration and appreciated this collaboration was the President of Indonesia. The integration of the PPP scheme with CSR received special attention because it was considered an effective innovation in overcoming infrastructure funding challenges. In addition, appreciation from the President is proof that this cross-sector collaboration can be a model for other regions, given the importance of synergy between the government, the business world, and the community in encouraging inclusive and sustainable development.

Building Trust

In an effort to realize the construction of Singkawang Airport, one of the important aspects that underlies the success of collaboration between various stakeholders is building trust. Strong trust between the government, the private sector, and the community is a foundation that allows them to work together effectively and harmoniously. One of the main ways to build trust is through the frequency of routine meetings, which provide opportunities for all parties to interact, share information, and discuss the challenges encountered. By creating an open and transparent dialogue space, the trust among stakeholders can be strengthened, so that collaboration in this project can run smoothly and succeed in achieving its goals.

From the observations of researchers, in various meetings held, it was seen that the participants present were representatives of all actors involved in this project, both from the central government, regional governments, and private parties. Each actor comes to describe the latest developments from the responsibilities and tasks carried out by each, such as the progress of infrastructure development, the readiness of supporting facilities, and other operational aspects. The presence of all these actors reflects a joint commitment to ensure the smooth preparation of airport operations, although the collaboration that occurs is not based on formal agreements.

Aspects of building trust in collaboration to support the PPP scheme in the construction of Singkawang Airport show positive results and have been going well. This can be seen from the active presence of the actors at each project evaluation meeting. This consistent presence reflects the high commitment and sense of responsibility of each party involved in the project, both from the government, companies, and CSR teams. The presence is not merely showing formality, but also reflects the awareness that building trust is an important element in this collaboration.

Managing Conflict

In the context of cross-sectoral collaboration, conflict is something that is almost inevitable. Various parties involved bring their respective perspectives, interests, and expectations into the collaboration process. Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006) in their theory of cross-sector collaboration, emphasizing that managing conflict effectively is the key to the success of collaboration, especially in large projects involving many stakeholders.

According to Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006), managing conflict does not merely mean resolving disputes when it occurs, but rather as a proactive effort to prevent and manage the potential for conflict through mutual understanding, a clear division of roles, and open communication. They suggest the use of collaborative resources to reduce power inequality, so that each party has an equal voice in the decision making process. Supply that is managed well can even be an opportunity to strengthen relations between actors and increase the effectiveness of collaboration.

In the aspect of managing conflict, this collaboration does not yet have a structured conflict prevention mechanism. This is caused by the absence of formal agreements that specifically regulate the procedure for preventing or resolving conflicts among the actors. Because collaboration runs without an official agreement such as an MoU or a binding contract, there are no written rules that describe steps to identify or prevent potential conflicts from the start. As a result, conflicts that arise in the field tend to be responded reactively and overcome through discussions at routine evaluation meetings.

This routine evaluation meeting ultimately became the only formal forum where the problems and obstacles faced in the Singkawang Airport operating project can be identified and discussed. Every actor present has the opportunity to explain the challenges encountered and provide input or solutions so that these obstacles can be resolved together. This is where

various perspectives and interests that may be different can be communicated openly and better managed, so that the conflict that occurs does not interfere with the overall collaboration process.

Thus, although there are no conflict prevention measures that are integrated in this collaboration structure, routine evaluation meetings indirectly function as a means of effective problem solving. Through this forum, each party can respond to conflicts or problems that arise and find solutions together, keeping collaboration running even without a formal framework that regulates managing conflicts.

In this aspect, the collaboration of the construction of Singkawang Airport shows that there is no preventive effort specifically designed to prevent conflicts or potential obstacles before the emergence of problems. In this case, the actors are more likely to be reactive, where conflicts or obstacles are only managed after the problem arises. However, when conflicts or obstacles occur, the completion mechanisms carried out indicate a strong pattern of cooperation. The actors involved are able to discuss collectively to identify the root of the problem and find alternative solutions. This shows that although the preventive approach is not a priority in the process of collaboration, the ability of actors to adapt and work together in solving existing problems is an important factor in the success of this collaboration.

Planning

According to Bryson, Crosby, and Stone (2006), in cross-sectoral collaboration, planning includes two types, namely planned planning and unplanned planning. Planned planning are steps and strategies that have been prepared and agreed upon by all parties involved. Here, all actors know what to do and what is the main target in collaboration. However, it also emphasizes that collaboration often requires flexible or unplanned planning, because in the field there are often unexpected situations. Under these conditions, collaboration actors must be prepared to adjust the plan or even make new steps that are not in the initial planning. This flexibility is important so that collaboration continues to run effectively and be able to adapt to any change or challenges that may appear in the middle of the road.

In cross-sectoral collaboration that supports the implementation of the PPP scheme, it is clear that the initial planning has been compiled carefully to achieve a common goal. However, in the implementation process, this project faces various unexpected obstacles. These obstacles require adjusting strategies and sudden planning, emerged as an adaptive response to the situation and conditions that develop in the field. This adjustment illustrates the dynamics of collaboration, where actors must be prepared to adjust their steps, showing that effective collaboration requires strong flexibility and coordination to face challenges that arise outside the initial plan.

In the process of constructing Singkawang Airport, found many dynamics that caused initial planning to come out of the planned predetermined plans. In accordance with the PPP mechanism, the airport operation should only be done after a business entity wins the auction to manage the airport. However, the implementation of pre-qualification and auction stages often experience delays, thus creating obstacles for project realization according to schedule. Facing this condition, the CSR took the initiative to accelerate airport operations. This initiative shows the flexibility in cross-sectoral collaboration, where the role of CSR is a driver that overcomes bureaucratic constraints and ensures that the project continues. This not only illustrates innovation in the management of public projects, but also emphasizes the importance of synergy between the government and the private sector in solving problems that arise during the development process.

The dynamics of the construction of Singkawang Airport showed a deviation from the initial plan, along with adjustments to operational challenges. At the planning stage, the

project is designed to follow the PPP mechanism, where the airport operation is planned to be carried out after the entire PPP process, including the auction stages and the appointment of business entities. However, the delay in the implementation of pre-qualification and the auction process encourages an alternative initiative by the actors involved, especially through the contribution of CSR. This initiative allows the acceleration of airport operation even though the PPP process has not been completely complete.

In the aspect of planning, collaboration in the PPP scheme in the construction of Singkawang Airport shows the integration between the initial planning designed formally and dynamic planning that developed as a response to various challenges during implementation. Initial planning, which is fully dependent on the PPP mechanism, shows limitations in the acceleration of operationalization due to the delay due to the Covid-19 pandemic and the pre-qualification process that is delayed due to the reduced consortium interest. To overcome these obstacles, collaboration actors adopt a dynamic approach by carrying out the inaugural flight using the aircraft charter method as a strategy to strengthen the market attractiveness and show the economic prospects of the airport to the public and stakeholders.

This step reflects the flexibility in planning that does not only function as a guide, but also as a tool that is responsive to real conditions. Cross-sectoral collaboration that is able to integrate formal planning with strategic innovations is the key to success in realizing Singkawang Airport. This shows that the successful development of strategic infrastructure is not only determined by the quality of initial planning, but also by the ability of collaboration actors to manage changes and adjust the planning with the needs and challenges that arise in the field.

CONCLUSION

In the aspect of forging initial agreements in cross-sector collaboration in supporting the implementation of the PPP scheme in the construction of Singkawang Airport, there is an agreement that is formal and non-formal. However, formal settings do not cover the whole actors involved in this collaboration. At present, the formal foundation is only in the form of two Decree of the Mayor of Singkawang. Both of these decree only set a local team in the Singkawang City Government area but did not regulate all actors of collaboration across sectors. The success of this national strategic project. On the other hand, CSR involvement in this collaboration is not regulated in formal cooperation documents. All infrastructure built by the CSR will be donated to the Ministry of Transportation, so that the available documents are only in the form of handover of grants, without any detailed arrangement of responsibility. Cross-sectoral collaboration in PPP in the construction of Singkawang Airport is mostly non-formal and dynamic. Although there has been a formal basis through the Mayor's Decree, relations between actors, including CSR, have not been fully integrated in a more comprehensive collaboration framework.

In aspects of building leadership, there are formal and non-formal leadership that play a significant role. The formal leadership is carried out by the Indonesian Ministry of Transportation as the person in charge of the cooperation project, which is fully responsible for the planning, implementation and supervision of the project in accordance with the provisions of the PPP scheme. On the other hand, non-formal leadership is played by Mrs. Tjhai Chui Mie, former Mayor of Singkawang and Chairman of the CSR Team, who has a strategic role in ensuring the smooth contribution of CSR, including financial support. In addition, he also contributed to the success of the inaugural commercial flights at Singkawang Airport, marking important progress in this project. Synergy between formal and non-formal leadership is a major factor in directing cross-sector collaboration to achieve development goals effectively.

In the aspect of building legitimacy, not only includes the main actors who are directly involved in collaboration but also involve legitimacy from external parties. One of the significant forms of strengthening legitimacy is the appreciation of the President of the Republic of Indonesia, Joko Widodo. This recognition confirms that the collaboration carried out is not only in harmony with national priorities but also shows concrete results that can be appreciated at the national level. The existence of this legitimacy not only increases the credibility of cross-sector collaboration but also has a positive influence on public perception. With the existence of strong formal and non-formal legitimacy, this collaboration is able to strengthen the position of construction of Singkawang Airport as an example of the success of the implementation of PPP which is supported by synergy between the government, private and community sectors.

Building trust in the PPP collaboration for the construction of Singkawang Airport is carried out through a routine meeting mechanism held once a few months. This meeting became a strategic forum for all actors to evaluate progress, identify obstacles, and discuss solutions collectively. This approach creates a dialogue space that allows each actor to express his views, describe the challenges encountered, and provide input related to the direction of collaboration.

In the managing conflict aspect, collaboration in the construction of Singkawang Airport has not implemented special efforts that are preventive to prevent conflicts or obstacles early on. The approach taken is more reactive, where conflicts or problems are handled after appearing. However, when the challenge occurs, all actors are able to work together collectively to find effective alternative solutions. This reflects the flexibility and willingness of the actors to adapt and overcome obstacles in order to achieve common goals. Although this approach is quite effective in resolving existing conflicts, there is an opportunity to improve the quality of collaboration by applying preventive steps to mitigate potential problems in the future.

In the planning aspect, collaboration in supporting the PPP scheme in the construction of Singkawang Airport reflects a combination of structured planning and dynamic planning. Structured planning is the initial guide to ensure the direction of collaboration in accordance with the specified objectives. However, in practice, dynamic planning emerged in response to various problems that occurred during the development process. This dynamic planning is adopted as a solution to overcome obstacles and adjust collaboration steps to remain relevant to the situation and conditions that develop. This shows that the ability to adapt in planning is one of the key factors in the success of collaboration. A flexible and responsive approach to change makes this project continue despite facing various challenges.

REFERENCES

- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 18(4), 543-571.
- Bryson, J. M., Crosby, B. C., & Stone, M. M. (2006). The design and implementation of Cross-Sector collaborations: Propositions from the literature. *Public administration review*, 66, 44-55.
- Bryson, J. M., Crosby, B. C., & Stone, M. M. (2015). Designing and implementing cross-sector collaborations: Needed and challenging. *Public administration review*, 75(5), 647-663.
- Cairns, B., & Harris, M. (2011). Local cross-sector partnerships: Tackling the challenges collaboratively. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 21(3), 311-324.
- Chiang, B., & Cheng, J. C. Y. (2019). Chinese capital and Chinese cultural capital: A case study of Singkawang, West Kalimantan, Indonesia. *The Sociology of Chinese Capitalism in Southeast Asia: Challenges and Prospects*, 315-330.

- Dimitriou, D., & Sartzetaki, M. (2022). Assessment of socioeconomic impact diversification from transport infrastructure projects: The case of a new regional airport. *Transportation Research Record*, 2676(4), 732-745.
- Hadi, S., Hamzah, M. Z., & Sofilda, E. (2023). Public private partnership development model (PPP) in the provision of airport infrastructure in indonesia. *ECOBESTHA*, 2, 178-198.
- Hertzman, E. (2020). What does it mean to be 'called home' from overseas? The case of Hakka Chinese Indonesian youth from West Kalimantan. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 46(16), 3526-3542.
- Isdairi, I., & Sihaloho, N. T. P. (2021). Rebuilding the Local Government Partnership Model in Tourism Recovery After the COVID-19 Pandemic: Case Study in Singkawang City, Indonesia. *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(3), 346-352.
- Khan, N., Hassan, A. U., Fahad, S., & Naushad, M. (2020). Factors affecting tourism industry and its impacts on global economy of the world. *Available at SSRN 3559353*.
- Klitsie, E. J., Ansari, S., & Volberda, H. W. (2018). Maintenance of cross-sector partnerships: The role of frames in sustained collaboration. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 150, 401-423.
- Maisondra, M. (2023). Cultural Acculturation on the Acceptance of the Role of Chinese Ethnicity in Singkawang City Government. *Jurnal Bina Praja: Journal of Home Affairs Governance*, 15(2), 261-274.
- Mandasari, R., & Setiawan, B. (2023). Cultural Tourist Attractions at The Cap Go Meh Festival in Singkawang City. *Jurnal Syntax Transformation*, 4(12), 53-61.
- Mandić, A., Mrnjavac, Ž., & Kordić, L. (2018). Tourism infrastructure, recreational facilities and tourism development. *Tourism and hospitality management*, 24(1), 41-62.
- Muazir, S., & Hsieh, H. C. (2019). Urban network in strategic areas in Indonesia case study: Sambas Regency, West Kalimantan. *Journal of Design and Built Environment*, 19(2), 14-29.
- Nugraha, R. A. (2024). Airport Development In Indonesia: Quo Vadis?. *Lex ad Coelum*, 4(I), 18-23.
- Nusriadi, L., Avianti, I., Tanzil, N. D., & Parikesit, D. (2023). The Collaborative Governance Elements Contributing to Implementing Public-Private Partnerships: A Systematic Literature Review. *Journal of Namibian Studies: History Politics Culture*, 33, 4473-4489.
- Nyoto, N., Effendi, I., Evizariza, E., & Effendi, I. (2023). Bakar Tongkang festival in Bagansiapiapi, Indonesia—from Chinese fisherman ritual to tourism and economic impact. *Review of Applied Socio-Economic Research*, 26(2), 83-93.
- Ong, C. E., Ormond, M., & Sulianti, D. (2017). Performing 'Chinese-ness' in Singkawang: Diasporic moorings, festivals and tourism. *Asia Pacific Viewpoint*, 58(1), 41-56.
- Putro, Y. M., & Nugraha, R. A. (2023). Challenges for Indonesian Airport Development: Is PPP an Answer?.
- Setyowati, D. L., Astuti, T. M. P., & Kurniawan, E. (2020). Communal Awareness of Diversity to Enforce Tolerance Tourism in Singkawang City. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 11(2), 460-470.
- Submitter, G. A. T. R., Elyta, E., & Herlan, H. (2021). Politics of Harmony, Social Capital and Tolerant Cities. *Journal of Finance and Banking Review*, 6(1), 51-61.
- Van Tulder, R., Seitanidi, M. M., Crane, A., & Brammer, S. (2016). Enhancing the impact of cross-sector partnerships: Four impact loops for channeling partnership studies. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 135, 1-17.
- Velotti, L., Botti, A., & Vesci, M. (2012). Public-private partnerships and network governance: What are the challenges?. *Public Performance & Management Review*, 36(2), 340-365.

Xiong, W., Chen, B., Wang, H., & Zhu, D. (2019). Governing public–private partnerships: A systematic review of case study literature. *Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 78(1), 95-112.