Comparing the Foreign Media Representation Between Turkey and Indonesia Based on Online Media Newspapers

Dela Anjelawati¹*, Lely Arrianie²

¹ Lecturer, Universitas Nasional Jakarta, Indonesia, Email: dela.anjelawati@civitas.unas.ac.id
² Senior Lecturer, Universitas Nasional Jakarta, Indonesia, Email: lelyarrianie@civitas.unas.ac.id

*Corresponding Author: Dela Anjelawati

Abstract: Turkey-Indonesia relations can be traced back to the Ottoman Empire. For many years, bilateral cooperation outside Turkey and Indonesia continue to work together within the framework of international and regional organizations. Media studies are expected to provide benefits in the increased relation between the two countries. Therefore, it is interesting to analyse how the media representation in Indonesia and Turkey construct the image about one and another. This work analyses image, and news value in order to understand the media representation of Turkey and Indonesia. this study will observe the news representations of Indonesia and Turkey in terms of their representations as country, country's news actors, and relation between Turkey and Indonesia. This study will examine how Indonesia and Turkey are represented in Turkey in the press in Indonesia. Specifically, theoretical perspectives are used to understand news production and understanding processes. These perspectives relate to Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) as the research approach of this study.

Keyword: Turkey Indonesia Relation, Media Representation, Foreign Media.

INTRODUCTION

Turkish-Indonesian relations can be traced back to the 12th century since Ottoman Empire periods. Closer diplomatic relations soon followed, culminating in the first exchange of ambassadors in 1547. military perspective. But as far as the relation ongoing increasing, there were no many scholars put attention to media studies in term of construct the presentation of Turkey and Indonesia in each national media. Media studies are expected to provide benefits in the increased relation between the two countries. How media give meaning to these interpretations are communicated within a culture and a shared set of ideologies of how things are in society. Partial or geographical “imaginaries” are representations of place and space that play a role in structuring people’s understanding of the world and which, in complex ways, influence people’s actions (Sellar et. al. 2009:253). From the argument, this thesis analyze how media in Turkey represent the image of Indonesia by their news. Then as the comparison, the analysis also in how media in Indonesia represent Turkey in their news.

The analysis will be restricted on how the news values of media representation in
Turkey and Indonesia about one and another. In “News Values and News Production,” Peter Golding and Phillip Elliott state “they [news values] are guidelines for the presentation of items, suggesting what to emphasise, what to omit, and where to give priority preparation of the items for presentation to the audience” (Golding and Elliott 632). There are similarities of media representation between the two countries, which make the comparison meaningfully.

Based on background of studies above, it can be concluded that analyzing the relation between Turkey and Indonesia by media studies is important in information society. How foreign media representations in Turkey and Indonesia construct the image about one and another? This study deals with how media representations constructed by one country's online newspaper about another country. Online media newspaper has been chosen as the source for this study because of the fast accessibility. By choosing news media online, tracking and categorizing of the news related to this research becomes faster and easier. This study will categorize, analyze, and concern to news as media representation which related to the two countries and the bilateral relation between them.

In an attempt to provide answers to the above set of questions, this work analyzes image, and news value in order to understand the media representation of Turkey and Indonesia. This study also develops a framework for foreign media representation which consists of three domains: the news action, the news actors, and the author evaluation. Equipped with this framework, this study will observe the news representations of Indonesia and Turkey in terms of their representations as country, country's news actors, and relation between Turkey and Indonesia.

More specifically, the theoretical perspectives are used to understand the news production and comprehension processes. These perspectives are relevant to Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) as the research approach of this study. This study investigates which news, discursive strategies, and linguistic devices are used to construct the image of Turkey and Indonesia. In all these, language plays a crucial role (see Delanty and Rumford 2005: 16-18).

This comparison study is also merger by three fields: Media Studies, International Relation, and Linguistic. Rather than merely conducting a linguistic analysis, this study tries to investigate how media represent about Turkey and Indonesia and the relation between them. The socio-historical basis of the construction the image about these countries also discussed. This research tries to contribute to our understanding of foreign media representation and relation of two countries. How media is playing the role of “constructive image” about one country. By providing categories, characteristics, quantities and values analysis of the news, this study analyzes how the relation between Turkey and Indonesia be displayed by media.

This study aims to contribute to the growing literature on foreign media representation studies to analyze two countries relation. As studies in media representations about another country are rare, especially between Turkey and Indonesia, this study hopes to contribute towards understanding the dynamic and complex negotiations involved in representing a foreign country in one’s news. In the Turkish-Indonesia context, comparison studies about these countries’ news media were also very few, and thus the findings of the analysis would add to the mosaic of images and perceptions about each other. It is hoped that this would contribute towards improving mutual understanding between Turkey and Indonesia and foreign media relation between them.

**RESEARCH METHODS**

The methods of data collection and data analysis by choosing and analyzing the media output by topic, event and/or period during the relation between Turkey and Indonesia. The data in this study took from 2 different online newspaper website; one Turkish broadsheet (http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/) and one Indonesian broadsheet (http://www.thejakartapost.com/). Remembering more than 300,000 articles found related to
the study, therefore it is important to limit the data analysis to be some topics. It gives three samples of analysis of the data according to various topics. The following topics have been selected are below:
1. Country's event,
2. Country's news actors,
3. Author Evaluation Analysis

This study has applied an integrated quantitative and qualitative approach in conducting the research. The quantitative approach can be seen in the textual analysis to determine the occurrence representational of three selected topics mentioned above, that tokens found in the data.

The findings are further qualitatively analyzed and interpreted following Fairclough’s three-dimensional analysis (Fairclough 1989, 1992, 1995). The discursive and social practices of the data, that is, the Turkish news articles about Indonesia and Indonesian news articles about Turkey are taken into consideration when the textual data is being analyzed. This study decided to observe news representations of Indonesian in Turkish press from social, cognitive, and cultural perspectives.

The topics above are analyses by discourse analysis which ‘tends to be better at revealing latent or hidden meanings. As mentioned in the introduction, this research analyses the content of media publications by means of qualitative analysis, namely discourse analysis. This includes a textual analysis which identifies positive and negative words and phrases used. This (textual) part of the discourse analysis is like narratology. ‘Narratology [...] focuses on the narrative or storytelling within a text with emphasis on meaning that may be produced by its structure and choice of words. This research uses discourse analysis as research methods to analyze images and signs, used by media to find meanings of texts. When analyzing media texts, Teun van Dijk’s and Norman Fairclough’s critical discourse methods are applied.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Representation is simply the process in which such meanings are produced and constructed. While media can create new meaning of that reality through producing the representation. Media also take part to produce and construct the presentation with purposed meaning. Representation products of media are being in front of many motives. The interests of power structure, elite nation, media ownership, media crew and market demand are standing behind the media representation.

In the first perspective stream, the “clash of cultures” surely as the key determinant of foreign media representation of one country. When the process of representing another country or culture, media crews normally perceive that country or culture through their ‘cultural goggles’ (Nesbitt, 1971). This means they interpret the social practices they see in that country through their own cultural codes. In strongly claim that it is “impossible to transport and transplant words and concepts from one culture to another without changing their meaning” (Miller 1994: 74). We can fix that for “repository of difference” stream, signs, texts, representations, and discourses that constitute culture by grounding it in politics and ideology. The media crew see the other countries by their cultural goggles then influence to how the way they represent country in the media.

A second stream in the “culturalist” perspective does not assume difference but aims to “deconstruct” cultural representations, that is, uncover their underlying meanings. This work has produced several important insights into the form of and processes underlying particular representations. Many scholars in the field of cultural representation have applied the method and terminology developed by Edward Said in Orientalism, writing of and analyzing the stereotyped “orientalist” myths that Western culture has constructed of the Eastern “other” (Said 1985).
The third perspective through which news reports about Indonesia in Australian newspapers can be examined is the “political economy” (Freedman, 2000:159), that is, how media ownership and government policies influence media behavior and content. Economically, modern media companies with up-to-date research and communication systems need ‘big capital’ (McChesney, 2000, as mentioned in Freedman, 2000) to operate successfully. Golding and Murdock (1991) identify four historical processes that are central to a critical political economy of media; the growth of the media, the extension of corporate reach, commodification, and the changing role of state and government intervention.

Furthermore, in relation to privilege ‘media’ as intermediaries among the public, the government and the people who have an interest such as businessmen, academics, politicians, those scope became even much broader. In the global village, the media also play a role in terms of the relationship between the two and countries. For this field Cohen (in Melek 1997, p.14-15) emphasizes with how the media most important voice in the foreign policy field, as he asserted that,

"The press in its collective sense is perhaps the single most important voice in the foreign policy field, as informer, interpreter, advocate, and critic. He also pointed out that the media represent "a continuous and articulate link between foreign policy officials in the government and those people on the outside who follow world event" (1996, p.194)."

Related with statement above, Kingsbury (1997:124) also emphasizes the influence of bilateral relations on the media. He says “rather than journalism significantly contributing to bilateral relations, journalism or the criticism of it tended more to reflect those bilateral relations”.

**Foreign Media Representation; Media Analysis of thejakartapost.com**

Remembering more that hundreds news found related to Turkey so that the analysis focused to three major themes such as Analysis of Turkish news actors, analysis of Turkish news actions, and the relation between Turkey and Indonesia. I found 39 news that related to these major themes. From this selected news, the analysis can be started from the Turkish news actors the common appears. Based on the concept of ‘prosody’ (e.g., Martin & White, 2005) that the basic tone of a text reflects the writer’s stance, this analysis has observed that the reporters’ evaluation can be seen right from the headline and the lead paragraph. The body paragraphs serve as the details to support their evaluation reflected in the headline.

Recep Tayyip Erdogan as ex Turkish Prime Minister who became Turkish President has been common in Indonesian broadsheet media. The analysis shows distinctive representations of Recep Tayyip Erdogan in the aspects of Capability, Reliability and was equally evaluated high in religion value. In the several news show that RTE as a Turkish transformational leader who has very strong capability. Some news repeat that RTE has dominated Turkish politics for more than one decade. He also concerns to take part in humanitarian issues like conflict in Syrian and Kurdish. RTE is described as a leader who has high in religion value that place him as a leader of the Muslim world.

In another side, the analysis shows tend to be opposite representations of Recep Tayyip Erdoğan. In ‘Erdogan backtracks on social media ban threat (March 12, 2014)’ and some others news ‘Turkish PM struggles to contain corruption problem (December 27, 2013)’ can be seen that RTE has taken a variety of policies that tend to restrict public freedom. Several times social media have banned in Turkey after his corruption scandal reveals and the differences in political views problem with a rival Islamic movement led by Fethullah Gulen.

Moreover, RTE political policy that wants to change the presidential system Turkey has also appeared in several news. ‘Presidency move comes with some peril for Erdogan (July 1 2014)’ and ‘Turkey ruling party loses majority in blow for Erdogan (June 8, 2015)’ are two
news that discussing about his fundamental issue. Recep Tayyip Erdogan was explicitly and implicitly represented as Turkish leader with strong capability by doing many advanced and settled as a Muslim figure leader. But it also can be seen that RTE with strong power has taken a controversial policy to strengthen himself as leader.

The second analysis is Turkish News Action that related to the representation of Turkey as a country. How media is playing the role of “construct image” about one country. On the readers’ side, they readily and easily accepted what the news reporters wrote. As Johnson-Cartee says, “... lands far away and cultures outside of our personal experience suddenly become real as we attend to the mass media” (2005: 4). At the same time, however, overusing these choices can create stereotypes in the readers’ mind.

The news text that has been selected based on the representational choices most frequently made by the reporters in the selected online news media. Considering there are more than hundreds of news related to Turkey as a country, than dozens of news have selected to be analyzed into five categories such as Turkish policy to Syria, People, Politic, Infrastructure, Media Freedom.

The conflict in Syria such a huge humanitarian issue nowadays. As a neighbor of Syria, Turkey hosts half of the 3.2 million refugees who have fled from that country. Besides reported about million Syrian refugees, several news show about Turkish Policy to these refugees. It was often reported that Turkish government had a big effort to solve the refugee crisis. In ‘Amnesty report: Turkey strained by Syrian refugees (November 20, 2014)’ mentioned that Turkish government provides refugee camps operating at full capacity. Other news shows that Turkey allowed Syrian kids access to the Turkish schooling system.

Moreover, Turkish political condition was a common reported in Indonesian online broadsheet. Democracy in Turkey, issues about a new constitution and its location in a ‘Junction of Conflict’ are categories that frequently reported by the news reporters. Many important reforms have been made in areas such as human rights and freedoms, equality before the law and the independence of the judiciary. There are still many problems related to media freedom in Turkey be censured by human rights organization. This would be negative notes for Turkish democracy.

Furthermore, a plan to switch Turkey from a parliamentary to a presidential system would cause many problems for the country. In ‘Presidential System is a threat to Turkey (June 6 2015)’ reported that presidential system does not gain acceptance in Turkey. Although the system used by many countries but for Turkey it is a major risk. But the system will impair the unitary structure in Turkey.

In the last category, media freedom issue was also reported in Indonesian online broadsheet. With approval legislation from Turkey's parliament, government can control over the Internet by blocking the social media networks and websites. 'Turkey defends YouTube ban (March 28, 2014), Turkey blocks Twitter, Facebook, YouTube over images of slain prosecutor: Media (April 6, 2015) and other news can be seen that Turkish government has power to control over the media. Beside to preserve Turkey's security and the well-being of the people or the individual rights of citizens, this policy faced so many criticism by Western governments and human rights organizations.

The last analysis is how the relation of Turkey and Indonesia be displayed in thejakartapost.com online broadsheet. It has been analyzed into six categories such as trade, economy, military, music, TV series, industry, and terrorism. From 2014, Indonesian online media reported there were a significant increase of trading activity between Turkey and Indonesia. This increase be affected by some political wills between the two countries. News reported that, ‘Turkish-Indonesian partnership sees brighter future (Wed, October 29, 2014)’, ‘Government aims to more than double exports to Turkey (Tue, March 24, 2015)’ have shown the efforts of government of two countries to strengthen economy bilateral. Trading activity between Turkey and Indonesia dominated by various kind of agriculture products and palm oil, defense industry, military and terrorism and Turkish TV series growth.
Foreign Media Representation; Media Analysis of hürriyetdailynews.com

Remembering more that hundreds news found related to Indonesia so that the analysis focused to three major themes such as the analysis of Indonesian news actors, analysis of Indonesian news actions, and the relation between Indonesia and Turkey. I found 32 news that related to these major themes.

Indonesian news actors appear more variety in Turkish online broadsheet. For example, hürriyetdailynews.com generally had reported about three Indonesian presidents. Soeharto as an ex Indonesian president relatively equally reported in the negative aspects in Turkish online news broadsheet. By using some words to describe his moral ethics and integrity, the news broadsheet stated president Soeharto was the most controversial leader of Indonesia. In several news such, 'Indonesia’s Suharto clings to life (1/15/2008)' and 'Disgraced vilified ex-dictator Suharto dies (1/28/2008)' the news media mentioned president Soeharto as onetime and former dictator. Emphasizing by news 'Indonesia court orders Suharto foundation to return $325 (August/11/2015)' Soeharto was labelled as the most corrupt leader of all time.

In different side, currently Indonesian president Joko Widodo relatively reported in such positive aspect in Turkish online broadsheet. President Joko Widodo as known by his nickname Jokowi. He has described as a leader who comes without links to the autocratic past. By using some words to emphasize his down to earth character, Jokowi seen as likely bringing a new style of leadership. Just in few news reported his leader capability has generally disappointed investor as mentioned in, 'Indonesia's Widodo reshuffles cabinet to boost economy (August/12/2015)'.

The last Indonesian news actor who has been reported in Turkish news broadsheet is Prabowo Subianto. From several news related to him, but just one news focused discussed about this actor. Prabowo was a rival of President Joko Widodo in Indonesian Election 2014. In a news, ‘Indonesia to announce results in disputed presidential poll (July/20/2014)’, Prabowo has reported as one actors who took part in human rights abuse during the Soeharto’s era. As he ever married with one of Soeharto’s daughter. But other things related with his political performance was not reported in Turkish media. Prabowo known as a leader of Gerindra Party. The third big party in Indonesia according to the result of last election.

Turkish media tends to report in generally aspects. I noted that Turkish media rarely specifically discussed about ex Indonesian President, Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono. By keyword of Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, I did not find the news where specifically discussed about him. Whereas he was one of Indonesia president who re-established the relation between Turkish and Indonesian government in 2014.

Analyzing from the frequent of news, Turkish media relatively reported about Indonesian news actions in category of people and natural disasters that happened in Indonesia. Tsunami, earthquakes, and volcanic seismic often happened in Indonesia. Turkish news media reported these happened natural disasters frequently. Others natural disaster such as haze and the death of Sumatran Orangutan also reported in several news in Turkish online broadsheet.

The next categories that relatively be reported by Turkish news broadsheet were Economy, Infrastructure and Politic. In economy side, Turkish media have seen that Indonesian record investments recorded high growth in 2012. But for port expansion, Indonesia needed to boost the infrastructure to catch with others Asian countries. Infrastructure side has point out by news ‘Jakarta to seize land for public projects (December/17/2011)’. Indonesia still has to speed-up much needed infrastructure development in order to support foreign investors doing business there. Where in politic side, Turkish media did not put much attention to it. Just one news concern to represent about Indonesian political condition. By news, ‘Indonesia vote to set governor on course for presidency (April/09/2014)’, Turkish media just described the result of Indonesian Election in 2014.

Moreover, how the relation of Indonesia and Turkey be displayed in
hürriyetedailynews.com online broadsheet analyzed into four categories such as; trade, economy, military, and bilateral. Started from the early of 2010, Turkish news media noted that there were significant relations between Indonesia and Turkey in category of economy and trading activities. In the news, ‘Gül calls on Turkish firms to invest in Indonesia (7/1/2010)’, Indonesian media reported the strong political will from Turkish government to invest in Indonesia. The news has reported after bilateral visit of Turkish President Abdullah Gül to Indonesia in January 2010.

In 2010 and 2011, Turkish news media have reported so much news to describe the relation of Indonesia and Turkey was going to up. By signed some agreements included cooperation on defense industry, cultural exchange programs, and see transportation between the two countries can be seen the relation growth so fast. Even, during 2012 till 2015 Turkish news media still reported many positive news to represent the relation between Indonesia and Turkey. Concerned in military and bilateral categories, Turkish media putted some words to straighten the improvement of the two countries relation. The closer relation overtaken by similarity of largest Muslim country and members of several international and regional organizations such as, UN, OIC and G-20.

CONCLUSION

After analyzing all the selection news in previous section, the conclusions show there are differences and similarities in foreign media representations of that two-selection online news broadsheet. The different of specific classification and frequent coverage in the news come from the social, cognitive, and cultural perspectives of the news media to view news processes. The similarities characters of the foreign media representation by that two-news broadsheet could enrich the perspective of media analysis.

For similar theme observation, characteristic of representation could be different by the two-selection news broadsheet. For example, in country’s news actor analysis, Indonesian news media tends centralize to one news actor. The current Turkish President, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan was seen the most favorably reported by Indonesian reporters in thejakartapost.com. Among other Turkish figures, RTE most mentioned in every news related to Turkey. But, in other side Turkish media has shown that it reported Indonesian news actors in more variety actors.

If analyzing from the frequent of news can be seen that Turkish news media did not many report about Indonesian news actors. Where Indonesian media tends to focus reported one Turkish news actor frequently. This phenomenon can be analyzed by understanding that news as representations. One news actor may exactly be common on the empirical reality such mentioned in reflective approach to representation. It argued that language is said to function like a mirror. It can be questioned why news media reported one country’s actor in that kind of representation ways frequently. Or why news media did not report more frequently.

Moreover, Turkish news media frequently reported Indonesia in two major categories; people and natural disasters that happened in Indonesia. From all the selected news that related to people in Indonesia, Turkish media relatively portrayed the million people of Indonesia living in social problem conditions such poverty and injustice. Turkish news media often reported the happened natural disasters in Indonesia.

The difference can be seen in Indonesian media when it reports about Turkey as a country. The news related to represent Turkish people not much as other categories. Turkish political condition was a common reported in Indonesian online broadsheet. Democracy in Turkey, issues about a new constitution are categories that frequently reported by the news reporters. Indonesian news media relatively more variety in reported Turkey as a country. Indonesian news reporters also noted some issues about bombings and terror attacks in that country. So many of terrorist bombings and the murder also greatly affect to the image of Turkey as country.
The social, cognitive, and cultural perspectives are significant and relevant to the concept in critical discourse analysis as these have become the most accepted points of view of analyzing media representations. The news articles as the product of what to represent. It significantly influenced by news reporter’s personality, knowledge, interest, past experiences, and ideologies. The personal, social, political, and cultural contexts surrounding them will be taken into account in the data analysis and interpretation of the findings. This concept supports Fairclough’s discursive and social dimensions of analyzing discourse. As the result, representing others not only shows the objects of representation but also reveals the representing agents themselves.

In Turkish news broadsheet, for example, the representation about Indonesia as a country do not only talk about Indonesia but also reflect the Turkish reporter’s perspectives and why Turkish media make such representation about Indonesia. Reporting Indonesia in that kind of representation and select the news categories could imply that Indonesia may not necessarily see favorable as foreign country. It can be supported with the arguments of (Fairclogh,1992,1995 and van Leeuwen,2008) about how realities are portrayed in the news is not the same as what may happen in the ‘real’, because the writers as the representing agents give different degrees of happening reality. Shoemaker and Vos (2009) call this strategy as ‘gatekeeping’ that is controlling what gets included and whose voice are heard in the news.

Turkish news reported may do ‘gatekeeping’ in controlling what categories to represent about Indonesia as a country. As the same as what Indonesian news reporters did to represent Turkey in the news. I have noted that mostly the news that have been reported about Indonesia as a country in Turkish media did not report by hürriyetdailynews’s reporters. But hürriyetdailynews took the news from Agence France Presse (AFP). There was different condition in other categories such Turkey-Indonesia relation. Most of the news in hürriyetdailynews have wrote by its reporters.

In Indonesian news broadsheet, mostly the news reported about Turkey as a country have wrote by thejakartapost’s reporters and less from Associated Press (AP). But similar every news related to Indonesia-Turkey relation have wrote by thejakartapost’s reporters. This similarity can be noted in comparison analysis for the third theme observation, the relation between Turkey and Indonesia.

As the aim of this thesis to contribute the growing literature on foreign media representation studies in order to analyze the two countries relation. The last comparison analysis discussed about how Turkish and Indonesian news media displayed the relation of those two countries. Both Turkish media and Indonesian media similarly reported the improvement relation between Turkey and Indonesia in so many news. Turkish media started the news reports since the early of 2010. By reporting the significant relations between Turkey and Indonesia in trading and military sectors. In the next months during 2010 and 2011, Turkish news media have reported so much news to describe the growing relation of the two countries. By signed some agreements included cooperation on defense industry, cultural exchange programs, and see transportation between the two countries can be seen the relation growth so fast. Even, during 2012 till 2015 Turkish news media still reported many positive news to represent the relation.

Similar like hürriyetdailynews.com, from 2013 till 2015 thejakartapost.com also reported the improvement of bilateral relations between Turkey and Indonesia in trading and military sectors. This Indonesian online broadsheet has reported the relation in a very positive side. By analyzing several news in Indonesian broadsheet can be formulated that Indonesia news media tend displayed a supported news about the relation. By using the word ‘deeper’ and ‘greater’ to describe how the relation between the two countries should be a proof of media support.

Turkish and Indonesia news broadsheet has a privilege as intermediaries among the public, the government, businessmen, academics, politicians, and those scopes who interest to take part in supporting the relation between Indonesia. It can be supported with the argument of Kingsbury (1997) who emphasizes the influence of bilateral relation on the media. News media significantly contributing to bilateral relations by reporting the bilateral activities by two sides; as a supporter and critic.
Finally, I hope this study is useful towards understanding the mosaic of images and perceptions about Turkey and Indonesia. It is ended to build and improve the better bilateral relation between those two countries in the future. Hopefully in the next future, the relation of Turkey and Indonesia will spread in other categories. As representation can only partially describe one news actor, a variety of representations is necessary to build a rich mosaic of images of country’s figure in Turkey and Indonesia.

REFERENCES