

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.38035/dijefa.v5i3>

Received: 23 June 2024, Revised: 09 July 2024, Publish: 20 July 2024

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

The Role of BPD in Monitoring and Evaluation to Improve the Performance of Sihare'o Siwahili Village Government

Mauritius Theozanolo Zebua¹, Ayler Beniah Ndraha^{2*}, Fatolosa Hulu³, Eliyunus Waruwu⁴, Maria Magdalena Bate'e⁵

¹University Of Nias, North Sumatra, Indonesia, mauritiustheozanolozebua@gmail.com

²University Of Nias, North Sumatra, Indonesia, aylerndraha@gmail.com

³University Of Nias, North Sumatra, Indonesia, fatolosahulu@gmail.com

⁴University Of Nias, North Sumatra, Indonesia, eliyunuswaruwu@unias.ac.id

⁵University Of Nias, North Sumatra, Indonesia, maria.batee82@gmail.com

*Corresponding Author: aylerndraha@gmail.com

Abstract: This study aims to examine the role of the Village Consultative Body (BPD) in monitoring and evaluation (Monev) to improve the performance of Sihare'o Siwahili Village government. The research method used is qualitative with primary and secondary data sources. Data were collected through observation, interviews, and documentation. The results showed that the BPD has carried out the monitoring indicators well, including setting standards, measuring, and comparing. In addition, evaluation by the BPD has also been conducted, measuring the effectiveness, adequacy, and quality of village government work. However, there are several inhibiting factors faced by the BPD, such as the lack of welfare of BPD members, limited decision-making authority, and bias in the monitoring and evaluation process. Thus, this study provides a comprehensive overview of the BPD's role in M&E to improve village government performance.

Keyword: Sihare'o Siwahili Village, Village Government Performance, Monitoring and Evaluation, Role of BPD.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is a vast country, with a wide variety of cultures, ethnicities and religions. A country of this size certainly requires a strong and effective government structure from the central level to the village level in order to run well. One of the many lower-level government institutions in Indonesia is the village. The village is led by a village head who is assisted by the village secretary and other village officials, and supervised by the Village Consultative Body (BPD). In this context, the BPD has an important role not only in conveying the aspirations of the community, but also in conducting monitoring and evaluation (Monev) of the performance of the village government in accordance with applicable regulations in Indonesia.

Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) is one of the most important aspects of running an organization. Monitoring plays an important role in overseeing the course of an activity in the organization and ensuring all activities run as they should. The results of monitoring will affect the evaluation of personnel in the organization. The results of the evaluation will be taken into consideration for the organization in taking steps forward, and the evaluation will ultimately become a benchmark for the performance of personnel in the organization. Therefore, it is very important for an organization, especially government, to carry out monitoring and evaluation properly in order to produce optimal performance.

According to Suardan et al (2017: 77), monitoring can be interpreted as an activity to follow a program that is carried out steadily and regularly on an ongoing basis. Meanwhile, according to Azis (2016: 150), evaluation is a data collection and analysis of information about the effectiveness and impact of a stage or the entire program. According to Robbins, cited in the journal "Monitoring and Evaluation of Improving Teacher Performance at Al-Farabi Integrated Junior High School in Tanjung Selamat" (2023: 4), performance is a measure of what is done and what is not done by employees.

According to Law No. 6 of 2014 Article 1 paragraph (4) concerning Villages, the Village Consultative Body or what is called by another name is an institution that carries out government functions whose members are representatives of the village population based on regional representation and are determined democratically. In village governance, the BPD has an important role in M&E activities, where the functions of the BPD in monitoring are regulated in Permendagri No. 110/2016 Article 31 letter C and Article 32 letter J, and Law No. 6/2014 Article 55 letter C and Article 61 letter A. The duties of the BPD in evaluation are regulated in Permendagri No. 110/2016 Article 32 letter K, and Law No. 6/2014 Article 27 letter C.

Based on the above regulations, it can be seen that the BPD plays an important role in M&E activities of the village government. The BPD has the right to conduct monitoring in the form of supervising the performance of the village head, as well as supervising and requesting information about the implementation of village governance to the village government. The BPD also has the right to conduct evaluations in the form of evaluating reports on the implementation of village governance.

Monitoring in the village is not only done by the BPD, but also indirectly by the community. The community has the right to convey their aspirations and complaints through the BPD in accordance with the duties of the BPD in Permendagri No. 110/2016 Article 31 paragraph (2), Article 32, Article 60, and Article 63, and Law No. 6/2014 Article 55 paragraph (2) and Article 63. Therefore, the community also has a role in monitoring village governance. This is in accordance with the theory of community participation according to Isbandi (2007: 27), where community participation is the participation of the community in the process of identifying problems and potential in the community, selecting and making decisions about alternative solutions to deal with problems, implementing efforts to overcome problems, and community involvement in the process of evaluating changes that occur.

The Village Consultative Body (BPD) has significant functions and authorities in the implementation of village governance. According to Firman (2020), the BPD plays a role in organizing village governance with the functions of legislation, control, and mediation. The BPD is a very important body in the village government structure, because it functions as an institution that accommodates and channels the aspirations of the village community and supervises the performance of the village government.

According to Law No. 6/2014 on Villages, the BPD is an institution whose members are democratically appointed representatives of the village population. The BPD is tasked with discussing and agreeing on draft village regulations with the village head, accommodating and channeling the aspirations of the village community, and supervising the

performance of the village head. In the context of monitoring and evaluation, the BPD has the right to request information from the village head about the implementation of village governance, as well as to evaluate reports on the implementation of village governance.

Monitoring and evaluation (Monev) are two interrelated and important activities in village governance management. Monitoring is the process of continuously collecting data and information to determine the progress and achievement of ongoing activities, as well as to detect problems that may arise during the implementation of these activities. Evaluation, on the other hand, is the process of systematically and objectively assessing an activity or program to determine the level of achievement of predetermined goals and objectives.

According to Herlina (2018), monitoring is the process of continuously collecting data and information to measure the progress and performance of the program, as well as to detect problems that may arise. Meanwhile, evaluation is the process of systematically assessing program implementation to determine the effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, and impact of the program.

In the context of village governance, M&E is conducted to ensure that planned programs and activities can be implemented properly and achieve the set objectives. M&E also aims to improve accountability and transparency in village governance, and to ensure that funds and resources are used effectively and efficiently. The BPD has a very important role in monitoring and evaluating the performance of the village government. According to Malik (2020), the BPD has a monitoring function that includes monitoring the implementation of village regulations, monitoring the implementation of village head decisions, and monitoring the implementation of planned programs and activities. In conducting monitoring, the BPD can collect data and information regarding the implementation of ongoing programs and activities, as well as conduct direct checks in the field to ensure that the programs and activities are implemented in accordance with the plan. The BPD can also request information reports from the village head regarding the implementation of programs and activities that have been implemented.

Evaluation is conducted by the BPD by assessing and analyzing information reports submitted by the village head, as well as by conducting direct checks in the field to see the results of the implementation of programs and activities that have been carried out. This evaluation aims to assess the effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, and impact of the programs and activities that have been implemented, as well as to provide recommendations for improvement if necessary.

In carrying out its role, the BPD in Sihare'o Siwahili Village faces various problems and challenges. One of the main problems faced is the lack of understanding of the role and main duties and functions of the BPD. This is due to the lack of guidance and direction from the sub-district head or superiors, as well as the lack of a guidebook on the main duties and functions of the BPD by each BPD member (Roza & Laurensius, 2017). Another problem faced is the lack of access to information and data owned by the BPD, making it difficult to conduct M&E of the village government. This is due to the lack of serious attention from BPD members to the programs proposed by the village government, as well as the lack of detailed explanations from the village government regarding the work plans and programs to be implemented (Irfiani, 2018).

The lack of community involvement in village development is also a significant problem. The community in Sihare'o Siwahili Village tends to be less concerned about village development if they do not receive compensation in accordance with the regional minimum wage (UMR). In fact, community involvement is very important to ensure that programs and activities are implemented in accordance with the needs and desires of the community (Uwang, et al., 2018). This encourages researchers' curiosity to examine the role of BPD in various activities and problems in a village, both in terms of communication and

delivery of aspirations, to supervision and evaluation in equalizing village development. Based on the above background, researchers are interested in conducting research with the title **"The Role of BPD in Monitoring and Evaluation to Improve the Performance of Sihare'o Siwahili Village Government"**.

METHO

This research was conducted in Sihare'o Siwahili Village, Jln. Fondrako K.M 3,4-5,4 West Gunungsitoli District, Gunungsitoli City. This research uses qualitative research methods, where qualitative research is research that intends to understand phenomena about what is experienced by research subjects such as behavior, perceptions, motivations, actions and others with decryption in the form of words (Moleong, 2017: 6). Variables according to Hatch and Farhady (Sugiyono, 2015: 38) are attributes or properties and values of objects that have certain variations between one another. This study uses three variables, namely monitoring, evaluation, and performance. The data sources obtained by researchers come from primary data sources and secondary data.

Sugiyono (2013) reveals data collection techniques as the most strategic step in research because the main purpose of the research is to get data. According to Sugiyono (2018) data collection techniques consist of observation, interviews, questionnaires, and documentation. To collect data, in this study the authors used observation, interview and documentation techniques.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Existing Conditions of Monitoring Indicators in Sihare'o Siwahili Village

Monitoring is the collection of data about activities or programs to be processed into information that can be used to document ongoing monitoring on an ongoing basis (Azis, 2016: 147). The following are monitoring indicators in Sihare'o Siwahili Village:

a. Setting Standards

In running an organization, minimum standards are required that must be implemented, met, or achieved to ensure the desired results. According to Robbins and Coulter in Satriadi (2016: 290), setting standards is setting benchmarks or desired results as a comparison of results during organizational activities. Standards are also restrictions on what must be done to achieve organizational goals and targets.

Based on an interview with Mr. Sonitehe Gea, S.H., M.M., Chairman of the Sihare'o Siwahili Village Consultative Body, on Thursday, January 18, 2024, he explained that the BPD has set standards in monitoring. "The standard is that we regularly coordinate with the village government. And every activity carried out in the field, for example development, the BPD periodically conducts monitoring. The standards used come from the BPD's own internal meetings that have been jointly agreed upon, where the results of the agreement are coordinated with the village government. Until now, the BPD has succeeded in implementing these standards in accordance with what we have set before."

Similarly, Pj. Sihare'o Siwahili Village Head, Mr. Satieli Zebua, on Saturday, February 3, 2024, added that setting targets for village activity programs involves all parts of the village administration including the BPD and the community in the form of village meetings. "Obstacles that can arise from this determination and planning process, for example, are government regulations from above that change, so there are programs that are not implemented as expected. In addition, unavoidable situations such as the emergence of the COVID-19 outbreak have caused many plans to be changed or postponed."

Direct observation in Sihare'o Siwahili Village shows that standard-setting has been done well. Every member of the village council and village government knows exactly what their work and achievement standards are. Thus, it can be concluded that standard-setting has

been done well by the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD and is done in good coordination with the village government.

b. Measurement

Supervision requires measuring the results of the achievement of the object of supervision. According to Robbins and Coulter in Satriadi (2016: 290), measurement is a process that is carried out repeatedly and continuously to measure the quality and number of results.

Based on an interview with Mr. Suka Iman Zebua, Head of Financial Affairs of Sihare'o Siwahili Village, on Tuesday, January 16, 2024, he stated that the BPD supervises and measures village activity programs based on the achievement of outputs. Mr. Sonitehe Gea, S.H., M.M., Chairman of the BPD, on Thursday, 18 January 2024, added that the BPD is very instrumental in measuring village activity programs. "The data we obtain as BPD regarding every village activity is clear, both from planning to financing. In supervising the performance of the Village Head, we pay attention to the achievement of the village activities themselves based on the budget and implementation time."

The results of direct observations in Sihare'o Siwahili Village show that measurement is carried out well by the BPD, where each BPD member continuously oversees the activities and programs implemented by the village government. Thus, it can be concluded that the measurement carried out by the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD has been running properly, following all applicable procedures and carried out thoroughly on all village government activities.

c. Compare

When work results have been achieved, these results can be compared with the initial target to see how well the results have been achieved. According to Robbins and Coulter in Satriadi (2016: 290), comparing is comparing the results achieved with the target or standard that has been set. Based on an interview with Mr. Suka Iman Zebua, on Tuesday, January 16, 2024, he explained that PKP KD (Village Head) is responsible for supervising and comparing the results of village activity programs with predetermined targets, under the supervision of the BPD. "In the last two years, we have not found any gaps between program planning and the results we have achieved."

Pj. Village Head, Mr. Satieli Zebua, on Saturday, February 3, 2024, added that the main basis for comparison is the program design that has been made previously. "In this case, the person responsible for monitoring and comparing this is myself as Pj. Village Head, followed by the BPD." Direct observations in Sihare'o Siwahili Village showed that comparing activities were carried out well by the BPD, adhering to previously established plans and standards. Thus, it can be concluded that the comparing activities carried out by the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD have been running properly, following all applicable procedures and carried out thoroughly on all village government activities.

Based on the results of interviews and observations, it can be concluded that the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD has carried out the monitoring indicators well, including setting standards, measuring, and comparing. This process is carried out through good coordination with the village government and following established procedures, thus supporting the achievement of organizational goals and targets as expected.

Existing Conditions of Evaluation Indicators

Evaluation is a process of planning, collecting, and providing information needed to make alternative decisions (Purwanto, 2002). In Sihare'o Siwahili Village, evaluation indicators are used to assess various aspects of village government performance.

Effectiveness refers to the achievement of desired results in carrying out functions and work (Dunn, 2000). Based on an interview with Mr. Sonitehe Gea, Chairman of the BPD, it is known that the BPD of Sihare'o Siwahili Village has been effective in conducting evaluations of village government administration reports. Every quarter a regular meeting is held to evaluate the achievement of village program targets. Although there are obstacles such as BPD welfare that is not yet equal to the village government, the effectiveness of BPD is maintained (Buulolo et al., 2022; Caniago et al., 2022; Eliyunus Waruwu et al., 2023). Observations also show that the BPD is effective in conducting regular monitoring and evaluation.

Adequacy assesses the extent to which the results obtained can solve problems (Dunn, 2000). An interview with Sihare'o Siwahili Village resident, Mr. Elifati Zebua, revealed that development has not been evenly distributed and there is still injustice in the distribution of aid. Mr. Sonitehe Gea also stated that although many problems arise, the BPD always coordinates with the village government to find solutions (Gea et al., 2023; Gea et al., 2023). Observations suggest that the BPD has not been sufficient in responding to community demands and resolving all problems, despite its efforts.

Existing Conditions Performance Indicators

Performance is the result of processes based on predetermined conditions and agreements (Fahmi, 2018). The following are performance indicators in Sihare'o Siwahili Village. Work quality is measured by employee perceptions of the quality of work produced and the perfection of tasks against employee skills and abilities (Robbins, 2016). Interviews with residents revealed dissatisfaction with the work of the BPD and village officials who were considered unfair and uneven. Pj. The village head, Mr. Satieli Zebua, considered that village officials still need more training to improve the quality of their work (Gulo et al., 2023; Fandi Zulfian Zebua et al., 2022). Observations also show that the quality of work of BPD and village officials is still inadequate, causing various problems in the community.

Work quantity is measured by the amount of work produced (Robbins, 2016). Mr. Sonitehe Gea stated that the BPD is dominant in its supervisory function and ensures that village government programs are implemented. Mr. Satieli Zebua confirmed that all planned programs have achieved maximum targets (Buulolo et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023; Caniago et al., 2022). Observations confirm that the quantity of BPD work in overseeing village government activities is good and in accordance with the set targets.

Linkages between Indicators

Setting Standards with Work Effectiveness and Quality: The BPD sets standards through internal meetings and coordination with the village government to assess village programs. This monitoring improves the effectiveness and quality of work of village program planners and implementers (Buulolo et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023; Eliyunus Waruwu et al., 2023). Setting Standards with Effectiveness and Quantity: BPD standards in monitoring and evaluating village programs are effective, ensuring the quantity of work is done according to targets (Caniago et al., 2022; Fandi Zulfian Zebua et al., 2022; Gulo et al., 2023).

Setting Standards with Adequacy and Quality of Work: The standards implemented by the BPD were successful in solving some problems, but people felt that the quality of the BPD's work was still not satisfactory (Gea et al., 2023; Eliyunus Waruwu et al., 2023; Fandi Zulfian Zebua et al., 2022). Setting Standards with Adequacy and Quantity: BPD standards are good at solving problems and increasing the quantity of work of village government personnel (Buulolo et al., 2022; Caniago et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023).

Measurement by Work Effectiveness and Quality: Measurement by BPD in accordance with RAB and planning has improved the effectiveness and quality of village government

work (Gulo et al., 2023; Fandi Zulfian Zebua et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023). Measures with Effectiveness and Quantity: Measures taken by the BPD increase the effectiveness and quantity of village government work (Gea et al., 2023; Buulolo et al., 2022; Caniago et al., 2022). Measurement with Adequacy and Quality of Work: Measurement by BPD has not satisfied the community, indicating insufficient quality of work (Fandi Zulfian Zebua et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023; Gulo et al., 2023).

Measurement by Adequacy and Quantity: Measurements are sufficient to increase the output and quantity of village government work (Buulolo et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023; Caniago et al., 2022). Comparing to Effectiveness and Quality of Work: BPD compares results with targets, improving the effectiveness and quality of village government work (Eliyunus Waruwu et al., 2023; Gea et al., 2023; Gulo et al., 2023). Comparing to Effectiveness and Quantity: Comparing work results with targets increases the effectiveness and quantity of village government work (Buulolo et al., 2022; Fandi Zulfian Zebua et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023).

Comparing to Adequacy and Quality of Work: Despite comparing results with targets, people rated the quality of BPD work as not optimal (Gea et al., 2023; Caniago et al., 2022; Gulo et al., 2023). Comparing to Adequacy and Quantity: Comparing work results with planning helps ensure the quantity of work is as planned (Fandi Zulfian Zebua et al., 2022; Buulolo et al., 2022; Gea et al., 2023).

Factors inhibiting the role of the BPD in monitoring and evaluation to improve the performance of Sihare'o Siwahili village government

There are several inhibiting factors faced by the Village Consultative Body (BPD) in carrying out their role in monitoring and evaluation to improve the performance of the Sihare'o Siwahili village government. These factors include the lack of welfare of BPD members, limited decision-making authority, and bias in the monitoring and evaluation process.

1. Lack of BPD Welfare

The honorarium received by BPD members is still insufficient to meet their living needs. This has an impact on the lack of seriousness in carrying out their duties and functions, because BPD members must shift their focus to meet the needs of their families. According to Buulolo et al. (2022), inadequate welfare can hinder organizational performance, because BPD members become less motivated and focus more on other activities that can help meet their living needs.

2. Lack of Decision-Making Authority of the BPD

Although the BPD has an important role in monitoring and evaluation, they do not have the authority to make final decisions regarding village policies and programs. In carrying out its functions, the BPD still has superiors, namely the inspectorate and the kecamatan government, who have higher authority. This causes not all suggestions and inputs from the BPD can be realized. Caniago et al. (2022) and Gea et al. (2023) state that this limited authority reduces the effectiveness of the BPD in strategic decision making and policy implementation.

3. Bias of the BPD when Conducting Monitoring and Evaluation

Pj. Sihare'o Siwahili Village Head, Mr. Satieli Zebua, also serves as Secretary of the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD. This creates a conflict of interest, as one of the BPD members who is supposed to monitor and evaluate the Pj. Village Head is the Pj. Village Head himself. This causes bias in the monitoring and evaluation process. As identified by Waruwu et al. (2023), the presence of bias in monitoring can reduce the objectivity and accuracy of the evaluation conducted.

BPD Efforts in Monitoring and Evaluation to Improve the Performance of Sihare'o Siwahili Village Government

The BPD has various duties and functions in ensuring that the village government runs well. In carrying out its duties and functions in the field of monitoring and evaluation, the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD makes various efforts to improve the performance of village governance, including:

1. Ensuring Clarity of Standards Used

In carrying out monitoring and evaluation, the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD seeks to obtain clear data from the village government. The standards used are guided by the planning of village programs and decisions that have been made previously, such as the APBDes and the draft village activity program. According to Buulolo et al. (2022) and Zulfian Zebua et al. (2022), clarity of standards and accurate data are essential to ensure objective and transparent evaluation.

2. Continuous Coordination with Village Government

In the implementation of activities and programs by the village government, the BPD coordinates with the village government to solve problems that arise in the field. When problems are found, the BPD immediately takes corrective action in collaboration with the village government. Gea et al. (2023) and Gulo et al. (2023) stated that good coordination between the BPD and the village government can increase the effectiveness and efficiency of the implementation of village programs.

3. Always Closely Involved in the Planning and Evaluation Process Implemented in the Village Government

The Sihare'o Siwahili BPD is always present and active in every planning meeting for village programs and activities. The BPD holds regular quarterly meetings to evaluate the achievement of village government program targets, and holds year-end meetings to evaluate programs that have been implemented during the year. Waruwu et al. (2023) and Halawa et al. (2023) stated that the active involvement of the BPD in the planning and evaluation process can improve accountability and transparency in the implementation of village programs.

With these efforts, the Sihare'o Siwahili BPD is committed to improving the performance of village governance despite facing various challenges. These efforts demonstrate that active involvement and good coordination between the BPD and village government can improve the effectiveness and quality of the implementation of village programs.

CONCLUSION

Research on the role of the Village Council (BPD) in monitoring and evaluating the performance of the Sihare'o Siwahili village administration shows that the BPD plays an important role in this process. The BPD actively sets standards, measures and compares the results of village government activities with the targets set, and conducts quarterly meetings for evaluation. However, the effectiveness and adequacy of monitoring and evaluation by the BPD still needs to be improved, especially in addressing inequities in aid distribution and equitable village development. Although the quantity of BPD work is good, the quality of work is still considered inadequate by the community. In addition, community participation in village supervision and development remains low, and efforts need to be made to increase their involvement. The BPD faces several obstacles, including a lack of member welfare, limited decision-making authority, and bias in the monitoring and evaluation process. To overcome this, it is recommended that the welfare of BPD members be improved, their authority expanded, and regular training and capacity building provided. In addition, transparency and accountability in the implementation of village programs should be

improved to gain community trust and support. With these measures, it is hoped that the performance of the Sihare'o Siwahili village government can improve and achieve the goal of fair and equitable village development.

REFERENSI

- Azis, A. (2016). Program evaluation. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Buulolo, et al. (2022). Analysis of SISKUDES implementation in Sinar Baho Village, Lahusa District. *Journal of Empowering Management for Business and Administration (EMBA)*, 10(4). <https://doi.org/10.35794/emba.v10i4.43993>
- Caniago, A. P., et al. (2022). The role of the sub-district in evaluating Ladara village funds in Tuheumberua sub-district, North Nias Regency (Ladara village case study). *Simantek Scientific Journal*, 6(4).
- Eliyunus Waruwu, et al. (2023). Human resource planning and development. Malang: Future Science.
- Fandi Zulfian Zebua, et al. (2022). Evaluation of the implementation of the village financial system (SISKEUDES) in Orahili Tumori Village. *Journal of Empowering Management for Business and Administration (EMBA)*, 10(4). <https://doi.org/10.35794/emba.v10i4.43989>
- Firman, F. (2020). The role of the Village Consultative Body in organizing village governance. *Al-Ishlah: Scientific Journal of Law*, 23(1).
- Firman, F. (2020). The role and function of BPD in village governance. Jakarta: Prenada Media.
- Gea, F., Harefa, P., Lase, H., & Ndraha, A. B. (2023). The influence of attitudes and organizational culture on public services at the Gunungsitoli City Fisheries Service. *Innovative: Journal of Social Science Research*, 3(6), 1208-1223. <https://doi.org/10.31004/innovative.v3i6.6385>
- Gea, R. P., Ndraha, A. B., Hulu, F., & Waruwu, S. (2023). Analysis of the urgency of the teacher talent management system at UPTD SD Negeri 074056 Dahana Humene, Gunungsitoli Idanoi District, Gunungsitoli City. *JMBI UNSRAT (Scientific Journal of Business Management and Innovation of Sam Ratulangi University)*, 10(3), 2183-2193. <https://doi.org/10.35794/jmbi.v10i3.53501>
- Gulo, B., Waruwu, M. H., Mendrofa, S. A., Ndraha, A. B., & Lahagu, P. (2023). Analysis of information technology implementation in improving the effectiveness of community services at the Population and Civil Registration Office of West Nias Regency. *Innovative: Journal of Social Science Research*, 3(6), 1236-1247. <https://doi.org/10.31004/innovative.v3i6.6386>
- Halawa, P. A., Ndraha, A. B., Lase, H., & Mendrofa, Y. (2023). The role of community in human resource planning in Dahana Tabaloho Village government, Gunungsitoli City. *JMBI UNSRAT (Scientific Journal of Business Management and Innovation of Sam Ratulangi University)*, 10(3), 2119-2132. <https://doi.org/10.35794/jmbi.v10i3.53454>
- Halawa, S. J., et al. (2022). The dynamics of changes in employee professionalism as a form of adaptation to the new work system in business places in Gunungsitoli City. *Journal of Empowering Management for Business and Administration (EMBA)*, 10(4). <https://doi.org/10.35794/emba.v10i4.43997>
- Harefa, A., & Ndraha, A. B. (2023). Evaluation of planning in organizational development with implications for improving the economy of the Nias islands community through the Osseda Faolala Perempuan Nias consumer cooperative. *JMBI UNSRAT (Scientific Journal of Business Management and Innovation of Sam Ratulangi University)*, 10(3), 1836-1846. <https://doi.org/10.35794/jmbi.v10i3.52458>

- Herlina, A. (2018). The influence of the dimensions of supervision on the performance of state civil apparatus at the Pertiwi Mother and Child Hospital, South Sulawesi Province. *Economics Bosowa Journal*, 4(4).
- Herlina, H. (2018). *Monitoring and evaluation in program management*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Hia, I. M., & Ndraha, A. B. (2023). The urgency of training in human resource development at the Nias Heritage Museum. *JMBI UNSRAT (Scientific Journal of Business Management and Innovation of Sam Ratulangi University)*, 10(2), 1620-1630. <https://doi.org/10.35794/jmbi.v10i2.51797>
- Irfiani, H. N. (2018). Supervision of village government performance by the Village Consultative Body (BPD) at the Karangampel Village Office, Baregbeg District, Ciamis Regency. *Dynamics: Scientific Journal of State Administration*, 5(4).
- Irfiani, I. (2018). BPD challenges in monitoring and evaluating village government. *Journal of Government Science*, 7(2), 135-147.
- Kasih, M. I., et al. (2022). Strengthening communication between village government and BPD to produce quality village regulation products in Lolozasai Village, Gido Sub-district. *Journal of Empowering Management for Business and Administration (EMBA)*, 10(4). <https://doi.org/10.35794/emba.v10i4.43992>
- Laia, A. N., Ndraha, A. B., Buulolo, N. A., & Telaumbanua, E. (2023). Evaluation of early childhood non-formal education learning system at Sempoa SIP TC Gunungsitoli. *Innovative: Journal of Social Science Research*, 3(6), 6889-6904. <https://doi.org/10.31004/innovative.v3i6.7283>
- Laia, S., Halawa, O., & Ndraha, A. B. (2023). Analysis of the implementation of employee recruitment planning at the Nias Heritage Museum in Gunungsitoli City. *JMBI UNSRAT (Scientific Journal of Business Management and Innovation of Sam Ratulangi University)*, 10(2), 1668-1681. <https://doi.org/10.35794/jmbi.v10i2.51904>
- Laoli, A., Waruwu, E., Ndraha, A. B., & Zebua, D. I. (2023). Gender differences in college students' achievement in teaching English as a foreign language using inquiry-based learning. *Journal of Education and E-Learning Research*, 10(4), 666-673. <https://doi.org/10.20448/jeelr.v10i4.5047>
- Malik, S. (2020). The role of the Village Consultative Body in organizing village governance. *Journal Ius Constituendum*, 5(2).
- Malik, M. (2020). *Supervision in village governance*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Mardiyah, S. A., & Nurlinah. (2019). Analysis of the role of the Village Consultative Body (BPD) in governance in Pao Village, Tombolopao District, Gowa Regency. *Government: Journal of Government Science*, 12(2).
- Ndraha, A. B. (2023). Optimizing public services: Reconstructing the discordant relationship between local leaders to foster harmony (A case study of Indonesia). *Journal of Digitainability, Realism & Mastery (DREAM)*, 2(07), 18-34. <https://doi.org/10.56982/dream.v2i07.143>
- Ndraha, A. B. (2023). Transforming MSMEs: Pentahelix model and innovation in business license policy implementation in the era of industrial revolution 4.0. Surabaya: Pustaka Aksara.
- Ndraha, A. B., & Uang, D. P. (2022). Camat's leadership in increasing community participation in development in the era of disruption and social society 5.0 (Case study districts at Nias Regency). *Journal of Digitainability, Realism & Mastery (DREAM)*, 1(01), 55-66. <https://doi.org/10.56982/journalo.v>